



EXTERNAL EVALUATION - END OF PROJECT EVALUATION MOZAMBIQUE- WASH

PROJECT CODE: WASH 2017-2021 - 2017-08-MZ-DGD

DATE OF EVALUATION: JANUARY-MAY 2022

EVALUATOR(S): KEY AID CONSULTING (INFO@KEYAIDCONSULTING.COM)

EVALUATION MANAGEMENT TEAM (EMT):

- BRC-FL: WOUTER REBERGHEN (COUNTRY REPRESENTATIVE), DIDIER VAN AERT (HEAD OF INTERNATIONAL OPERATIONS), YOUSRI EL ADAK (EVALUATION MANAGER)
- CVM: MARIA NHUMAI, ILIDIO NHATUVE, JEQUESSENE FINIASSE, CRISTINA UAMUSSE

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

The evaluation is part of the programme 2017-2021 of the BRC-FL International Cooperation department financed by the Belgian Development Cooperation (DGD). The evaluation is focusing on the relevance, effectiveness, impact, efficiency, coherence and sustainability of the Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WaSH) program in Mozambique.

SUMMARY OF MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

Although most of the recommendations given made a valid point, some nuance was required in the context of Mozambique. Therefore, most recommendations are only partially accepted, and one was rejected.

MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TABLE

Recommendation 1: Improve the quality of needs assessments.				
Management response:		Response rationale:		
<input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted		The initial needs assessment for Mozambique was not optimal. Due to the lack of CVM staff at district level and absence BRC-FI staff in-county, the initial needs assessment was based on secondary data. At project-start, the decision was also taken to adjust the target area to CVM capacity, which was considered too low at Inhassoro district level at that time to successfully implement the project. As described in the initial proposal, an in-depth needs assessment and capacity assessment in the final target district did take place before implementation, which helped increase the relevance of the project through better targeting of communities.		
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
1.1 Needs assessments for future proposals must be improved	Continuous	BRC-FI + CVM		
1.2 Information management within CVM regarding needs in-country to be improved.	Continuous	CVM		
1.3 CVM to conduct a national situational analysis which can form the start for detailed needs assessments per proposal	Q4 2022	CVM		

Recommendation 2: Better integrate a WaSH market-based approach for latrine construction.				
Management response:		Response rationale:		
<input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted		Although cash or voucher assistance might have been a better suitable implementation method, the Mozambique government has been slow to accept these methods for development projects. Besides this, a market study was not included in the proposal, the project did not have the means to implement a full market-study to be able to implement a market-based approach for latrine construction. At the start of the project, discussions around the approach to latrine construction were indeed held. The chosen approach for latrine construction was based on positive experience within CVM during previous projects.		
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
2.1 Consider if market-study is viable and necessary at the beginning of the project.	Q3 2022	CVM		

Recommendation 3: Better plan volunteers' inputs.				
Management response:		Response rationale:		
<input type="checkbox"/> Accepted		Volunteer management is high on the agenda for necessary improvements within CVM. Both at central level, as well as Provincial and District level better coordination of volunteer input and communication towards volunteers should be addressed by the HNS.		
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
3.1 Institutionalize volunteer management at all levels	Continuous	CVM		
3.2 Include volunteer management in ToR's of project technician/managers	Q3 2022	CVM		

Recommendation 4: Involve the local authorities early in the programme design.				
Management response:		Response rationale:		
<input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted		In Mozambique, the local authorities were involved from the start of project design. During the selection of the communities, local government was again involved. This does bring additional challenges, as local governments often have their own political agenda, which can influence selection of beneficiary communities. Care should be taken to always balance the input of local authorities with verifiable information from an independent needs assessment to make sure that the most vulnerable are indeed reached with the project.		
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
4.1 Continue involving local authorities in project design and implementation	Continuous	CVM		

Recommendation 5: Better monitor the quality of slabs constructed by volunteers.				
Management response:		Response rationale:		
<input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted		The district WASH technician did monitor the quality of the constructed slabs. The monitoring reports did indeed mention problems with the quality of the slabs, which reportedly was due to the weather conditions (rain) during the rainy season which impacted the hardening of the slabs. After these reports, it was decided to pause slab construction during the rainy season to better guarantee the quality of the slabs.		
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments

5.1 Plan construction in dry season	Q4 2022	CVM		
-------------------------------------	---------	-----	--	--

Recommendation 6: Greater commitment to monitoring service levels to see how services perform.				
Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Partially Accepted	Response rationale: Although the district WASH technician was constantly monitoring the service delivery of the constructed water points, this information was not collected and stored in a structured way. During the baseline, midterm and end line surveys information on service delivery was collected. As service delivery was not included in the indicators for the project, the results were not included in the reports. It should be noted however, that the information was available to be used during the project for improving service delivery aspects where necessary. In future projects, it would be a good idea to include service delivery aspects in reporting, as a way to place more emphasis in this aspect of water supply.			
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
6.1 Include service delivery data of water points in project reporting	Q4 2024	CVM		

Recommendation 7: Simplify some monitoring indicators and internalize the analysis within HNS to make them actionable.				
Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted	Response rationale: Most WASH indicators (such as improved water supply coverage and improved sanitation coverage) are difficult to monitor without comprehensive data collection throughout the target communities. This was done by the HNS during baseline, midterm and end line. The results were available for the HNS and action was taken to focus on lagging indicators. As such, the indicators were actionable. But we agree that it would be a good idea to work out some simple monitoring indicators to provide additional information with shorter intervals, which could be used by the HNS to more actively monitor progress during the roll-out of the project.			
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
7.1 Create simple data collection tools to regularly collect information on improved water supply and sanitation coverage, including service delivery levels.	Q4 2024	CVM		
7.2 Improve monthly reporting tools to include more information on service delivery of water points	Q4 2024	CVM		

Recommendation 8: Improve communications with beneficiaries on the expected material to be delivered for latrine construction.					
Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted	Response rationale: We agree that communication with beneficiaries could have been better during the project. But the reasons for delays in delivery of materials for latrine construction were not foreseen by the project staff in the district. As such, the lack of communication might have been more due to the lack of communication around procurement processes from HNS HQ towards the project staff in the district, than between project staff and volunteers. The best solution for the recommendation would be to improve procurement processes at HNS HQ, which would minimize the delays themselves, making communication around delays unnecessary.				
	Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
				Status	Comments
8.1 Increase efficiency of procurement processes	Continuous	CVM			
8.2 Improve communication within CVM between the different levels (HQ – Province – District – Volunteers)	Continuous	CVM			

Recommendation 9: Provide a more comprehensive training to WUC.				
Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted	Response rationale: The report states that the WUCs reported that they received ample training and refreshment trainings during the project. A more comprehensive training to include other types of pumps would entail in-depth data collection with regards to the type of pumps present in each target community and providing tailor-made trainings to each WUC taking into account the different types of pumps in the area. In the target communities there are many old water points, which do not provide water due to various reasons, only one of which might be pump malfunction that would be repairable by a WUC with the relevant training. Other reasons for malfunctioning (older) boreholes include bad quality boreholes, clogged filters, changes in water level of the aquifer. Providing tailor-made trainings for different types of pumps found in the WUC coverage area would have entailed high additional costs, with an unknown cost-benefit ratio. Therefore the training provided were indeed focused on the Afridev pump, which was installed by the project. This is 1 of only 2 officially handpumps officially endorsed by the Government of Mozambique (the other pump Volanta, being endorsed for areas where the water needs to be pumped from a greater depth). Therefore, other pump types will have been installed by people or organizations which disregarded official government guidelines.			
	Apart from the above reasons for limiting the training to Afridev handpump maintenance, the District WASH technician and District driver with ample borehole construction and maintenance experience were present in the district during the full duration of the project and were available to support WUCs in maintenance of other types of handpumps where necessary.			

Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
9.1 Project Technician serve as a general focal point for community feedback also for non-project boreholes	Q4 2024	CVM		

Recommendation 10: Test water quality more systematically.				
Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted	Response rationale: <p>The government guidelines for water quality testing were adhered to. Comprehensive water quality test were conducted by the driller after borehole completion and the results were shared with the district government. While there might be improvement possible in these guidelines, water testing laboratories are not available in the district and province and systematic water quality testing would provide significant logistical challenges. The evaluation report does state that the problems with water quality as communicated by the WUCs was not with regards to the project installed boreholes, but other older boreholes which are now being managed by the WUCs.</p> <p>The official handover of the boreholes will still be conducted by the HNS and the recommendation to test the water quality of the boreholes before the handover will be considered.</p>			
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
10.1 Conduct water quality testing before official handover to government	Q3 2022	CVM		
10.2 For future projects, water testing results should be shared with the water committee, so that they can inform the community of the quality of the water.	Continuous	CVM		

Recommendation 11: Work on a sustainability framework.				
Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted	Response rationale: <p>For Mozambique, a form of post-project sustainability was already developed during the project: alongside some of the boreholes, water channels were dug and used to irrigate the surrounding area with waste water from the well. This resulted in increased crop yields, which could be sold in the market to generate income to help fund maintenance of the borehole and pumps. We agree that additional similar ad hoc solutions should be thought out, planned, and implemented in the future, and that these should be part of a larger, structured, framework approach.</p>			
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	

			Status	Comments
11.1 Identify more potential ad hoc solutions for sustainability, and compile them into a framework approach to be implemented in all future projects	Continuous	CVM & BRC-FI		

Recommendation 12: Map responses and actions that need to take place when (not if) a water point stops working.

Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Accepted	Response rationale: Developing a flow chart or logic model, together with Water Committees/community members and District authorities, that shows what happens when (a) minor breakdowns occur that can be resolved directly by the community and (b) major breakdowns that exceed user capacities and require rapid support, would be a good and useful initiative.			
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
12.1 Develop & distribute flow chart at community level	Continuous	CVM		

Recommendation 13: Offer a clear commitment to support operation and maintenance of WASH services, post construction for at least 3-5 years.

Management response: <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted	Response rationale: This work should be undertaken alongside the local authorities that are mandated to support rural WASH services, which was already the case in Mozambique, as local authorities were involved from the beginning of the project. A reiteration/re-reminder to the government of its future role and responsibility after project's end should be highlighted at the end of the project handover to the local authorities. However, without guaranteed follow-up funding allocated to the same project areas, BRC-FL cannot commit itself to the maintenance of WASH infrastructure and services after project end.			
Key action(s)	Deadline	Responsible	Tracking	
			Status	Comments
13.1 Involve local authorities in the project from beginning to end, and remind them of its future role and responsibility after project's end.	Continuous	CVM & BRC-FI		